

A comparative analysis of English textbooks —Those used in Korean elementary and Japanese junior high schools—

Keiko YONAHA

英語の教科書の比較分析 —韓国的小学校・日本の中学校—

与那覇 恵 子

要 旨

昨年筆者は韓国の小学校で英語の授業を参観する機会があり、その時、韓国の小学校6年の英語のレベルは日本の中学校1年の英語のレベル以上であるという印象を抱いた。それが今回の① 韓国の小学校の英語の教科書は日本の中学校1年の英語の教科書のレベル以上であるか。② 韓国の小学校の英語の教科書と日本の中学校1年の英語の教科書に見るそれぞれの特徴は何か。という2つのリサーチ・クエスチョン設定の背景である。2011年から日本でも小学校5年、6年を対象に英語教育が必修となるため、そのための準備が進行中である。この時期にこれらのリサーチ・クエスチョンに答えることは、これからの日本における小学校及びその延長線上にある中学校の英語教育を考察する上で意義深いと考える。①のリサーチクエスチョンについては、1. 英語一文の長さ、2. 新出単語の数、3. 学習対象である英文例の数4. 英文例に見る文法、②のリサーチクエスチョンについては主に5. 教科書の構成、6. 課の構成を分析の観点とした。①については、韓国の教科書は日本の中学校1年の教科書のレベル以上であること②については、韓国がコミュニケーションの手段としての日常使用される英語に焦点を当てているのに対し、日本は読解や異文化理解に配慮していることがわかった。

キーワード：教科書分析、韓国、日本、小学校英語教科書、中学校英語教科書

Abstract

This paper compares English textbooks used in the third to sixth grades in Korean elementary schools and in the first year of Japanese junior high schools. The two following research questions were set up. ①Is the level of English of Korean textbooks about the same or higher than that of a Japanese textbook? ②What are the characteristics of Korean textbooks and a Japanese textbook? The level of English taught is analysed using data on the vocabulary, the number and length of English sentences and the number of grammatical points introduced. As for the characteristics, important differences in the structure of the material are considered.

The level of the Korean textbooks is found to be approximately equivalent to or higher than that of the Japanese textbook. However, the Korean textbooks have a more practical and functional structure compared to a stronger emphasis on reading and cultural understanding in the Japanese textbook.

Key words: Textbook analysis, South Korea, Japan, Elementary school English textbook, Junior high school English textbook,

Introduction

The author had an opportunity to observe English classes at two elementary schools in South Korea two years ago, in 2007. It was then that she had the impression that the English level of South Korean elementary school sixth graders was about the same or higher than that of Japanese first year junior high school students. This paper attempts to substantiate the author's impression by comparing South Korean elementary school level English language textbooks and a Japanese junior high school English language textbook. Several papers have been published which analyze South Korean elementary school English language textbooks or Japanese junior high school English language textbooks separately. However, a comparative analysis of the two does not appear to have been done before.

In the year 2011, compulsory English education will officially start in the fifth and sixth grades in all Japanese elementary schools. We must consider what teaching materials to use at the elementary school level and what new transition materials should be used in junior high schools. The author believes that this comparative study of English language teaching materials will be a great help for educators considering future English language education at both these levels in Japan.

I Research questions

The author's impression that the English level of South Korean elementary school sixth graders was about the same or higher than that of Japanese junior high school first year students led to the following two research questions:

- 1) Is the level of South Korean elementary school English language textbooks about the same or higher than that of the Japanese junior high school first year English language textbook?
- 2) What are the characteristics of Korean textbooks and the Japanese textbook?

The Korean textbooks to be compared are those which are assigned by the Korean government for use in all elementary schools in South Korea from the third to the sixth grade. The Japanese textbook which will be considered in this paper is the one used in most of the junior high schools in Okinawa and is approved by the Ministry of Education.

In order to answer the two research questions, the author examined and compared different elements in the respective texts. In order to ascertain the English level, she compared 1) the length of the English sentences 2) the number of new words 3) the number of target English sentences and 4) the number of grammatical points introduced. To study characteristic differences she compared 5) the chapter titles and 6) chapter structure.

II Textbook analysis

1. The length of English sentences

The teacher's manual for the Korean textbooks states that the length of English sentences should not be more than seven words in third and fourth grade texts and not more than nine words in fifth and sixth grade texts (Kimura 2007). The results of the author's sentence length count are as follows:

Table 1: Frequency of different length sentences by grade (Korean textbooks)

Sentence length / Grade	3 rd grade	4 th grade	5 th grade	6 th grade	Total
Two words	1				1
Three words	6	1	4	2	13
Four words	1	7	6	6	20
Five words			4	4	8
Six words			1	3	4
Seven words			1		1
Eight words				1	1
Total	8	8	16	16	48
Average					4.17

In order to arrive at these figures, the author simply counted the number of target English sentences printed in the textbooks. Since South Korean teachers actually teach more English sentences in substitution drills, the number of sentences introduced is higher than indicated. However, the drill sentences do not appear in full written form in the textbooks, and the author decided not to include them. The results confirm that the advice in the teachers' manual is well observed and indeed that most sentences in the Korean textbooks are composed of only three or four words (68.8%), with an average of 4.17.

In the Japanese textbook, two thirds (66.6%) of the sentences are also composed of three or four words with an average of 3.92 as can be seen in table 2 below. Here too, the author restricted the word count to just the printed target English sentences, as with the Korean textbooks.

Table 2: Frequency of different length sentences in seventh grade textbook (Japan)

Sentence length	No. of sentences
Two words	5
Three words	25
Four words	17
Five words	6
Six words	8
Seven words	0
Eight words	2
Total	63
Average	3.92

According to the result that Kitao and Tanaka (2007) arrived at, the average number of words in a sentence in Japanese junior high school textbooks (21 books from 7 companies were reviewed) was 4.02 (7th grade), 5.76 (8th grade), and 6.70 (9th grade) respectively. Nagahara and Kimura (1990) acquired a similar result for one junior high school textbook (Horizon Series, 1987). The result was 4 (7th grade), 6 (8th grade) and 8 (9th grade) words per sentence. Our finding of an average sentence length of 3.92 words for the 7th grade book is therefore reasonably representative of Japanese textbooks.

2. The number of English words

Regarding the Korean textbooks, the teacher's book says that 80 to 120 new words each should be

taught in the 3rd and 4th grades and 90 to 130 words each in the 5th and 6th grades and that the total number of new words should not be more than 450 words (Kimura 2007). However, proper names of people, places, months and days of the week, as well as numerals and ordinal numbers, are excluded from the count. The new words introduced in the Japanese textbook are listed at the end of the book and they are total 450 words. (Table. 3) This falls to 381 words after the same exclusions, and is considerably lower than the recommended vocabulary of the Korean textbooks. Italicized words are those of names of people, places, months, and days of the week, as well as numerals and ordinal numbers and they total 75.

The 190 words in bold print in the table 3 are those that were not found in Korean textbooks. Therefore, 191 words out of 381 are also found in Korean textbooks and it means that 50.1% of the new words in Japanese textbooks are also in Korean textbooks. Not all new words are shown in written form in the South Korean textbooks but rather as pictures. The author counted these pictures as taught vocabulary. The words in the table 4 are the English words which the author found in the Korean textbooks with the same exclusion above. In this case the words in bold print are not found in the Japanese textbook.

The author found 419 words (excluding proper names of people, places, months and days of the week, as well as numerals and ordinal numbers, are excluded from the count) in four South Korean English textbooks. Out of the 419, the 229 words in bold print that were not found in the Japanese book. Therefore 190 of the words are also found in the Japanese English textbook, or 45.3% of those of the Korean textbooks. Word data in both of the textbooks was collected by typing manually. Regarding the English words, it can be said that the Korean textbooks and the Japanese textbook share about half, however, the number of new words learned in Korean textbooks is greater than those in the Japanese textbook. Tohno (2008) states that over the three years of Japanese junior high school English education, about 1000 words are taught and a similar level of English is achieved to that of elementary school English education in Asian countries.

Table 3: Japanese junior high school 1st year (190/456)

A	about	after	afternoon	again	ago	all	am	<i>America</i>
American	an	and	animal	any	apple	<i>April</i>	are	aren't
arrive	as	<i>Astro Boy</i>	at	<i>Auckland</i>	<i>Auckland zoo</i>	<i>August</i>	<i>Australia</i>	away
bad	bag	balloon	baseball	basketball	<i>Beck</i>	bed	big	bird
birthday	blind	book	bottle	boy	Braille	breakfast	brother	brown
but	buy	cafeteria	can	candy	cannot	can't	cap	care
cat	cent	<i>China</i>	Chinese	Christmas	class	classmate	club	coffee
collect	color	colorful	come	comic	computer	conditioner	cook	costume
custom	dance	date	day	dear	<i>December</i>	decrease	did	didn't
die	difference	different	dinner	do	does	doesn't	dog	doll
dollar	don't	door	dot	down	drama	dress	drink	each
eat	egg	<i>eight</i>	<i>eighteen</i>	<i>eighth</i>	<i>eighty</i>	<i>eleven</i>	<i>eleventh</i>	English
enjoy	eraser	evening	every	everyone	excuse	Fall	fall	family
fan	father	favorite	<i>February</i>	feel	<i>fifteen</i>	<i>fifth</i>	<i>fifty</i>	fine
<i>first</i>	<i>five</i>	flower	food	for	<i>forty</i>	<i>four</i>	<i>fourteen</i>	<i>fourth</i>
free	french fry	<i>Friday</i>	friend	from	fruit	gardening	gesture	get
girl	go	Godzilla	good	good bye	guitar	Halloween	hamburger	has
have	he	hello	help	her	here	here's	hero	hers
he's	hi	high	him	His	hobby	hold	home	homepage
homework	hot	hot dog	house	how	hundred	hungry	I	iced
I'm	in	interested	interesting	Internet	into	Is	isn't	it
its	it's	Jackolantern	<i>January</i>	<i>Japan</i>	Japanese	jazz	jellyfish	<i>Jill</i>
<i>Jim</i>	juice	<i>July</i>	<i>June</i>	junior	kill	kind	kiwi	know
large	leaf	learn	leaves	Let's	letter	library	like	like
live	<i>London</i>	look	<i>LosAngeles</i>	lot	love	make	many	<i>Maori</i>
<i>March</i>	math	<i>May</i>	me	mean	meet	member	<i>Mihi</i>	milk
mine	mistake	<i>Monday</i>	month	morning	mother	Mr.	Ms.	Mt.
<i>Mt.Taranki</i>	much	music	my	name	near	New	<i>New York</i>	<i>Yankees</i>
<i>New Zealand</i>	next	nice	nickname	night	<i>nine</i>	<i>nineteen</i>	<i>ninety</i>	<i>ninth</i>
no	noon	nose	not	notebook	<i>November</i>	now	number	o'clock
<i>October</i>	octopus	of	off	often	oh	old	on	<i>one</i>
only	or	orange	other	our	ours	pen	pencil	people
pet	phone	picture	plastic	play	player	please	popular	practice
pumpkin	read	really	receive	rice cake	right	rock	round	run
salmon	same	<i>Santiago</i>	<i>Saturday</i>	say	school	sea	season	<i>second</i>
section	see	sell	<i>September</i>	seven	<i>seventeen</i>	<i>seventh</i>	<i>seventy</i>	shampoo
she	sheep	sheet	she's	shoe	shopping	show	sincerely	sister
sit	<i>six</i>	<i>sixteen</i>	<i>sixth</i>	<i>sixty</i>	sleepy	small	smell	smooth
snow	so	soccer	soft	some	sometimes	sorry	space	speak
special	sport	Spring	square	stand	student	study	style	subject
Summer	sun	Sunday	sure	sweet	<i>Sydney</i>	take	talk	tall
tea	teach	teacher	team	tell	<i>ten</i>	tennis	<i>tenth</i>	thank
Thanksgiving	that	that's	the	their	theirs	them	then	there
these	they	they're	<i>third</i>	thirsty	<i>thirteen</i>	<i>thirty</i>	this	those
three	throw	<i>Thursday</i>	time	to	toast	today	together	too
<i>touch</i>	try	<i>Tuesday</i>	turkey	turtle	TV	<i>twelfth</i>	<i>twelve</i>	<i>twenty</i>
<i>two</i>	<i>Ultra man</i>	up	us	use	very	visit	volunteer	walk
want	Warm	watch	we	<i>Wednesday</i>	welcome	well	what	what's
when	when's	where	where's	which	who	who's	whose	why
window	Winter	with	word	work	world	write	year	yes
yesterday	You	your	you're	yours	<i>zero</i>			

Table 4: New words in the Korean textbooks

3rd grade (37/86)

a	am	apples	bag	banana	basketball	bear	big	birthday
book	cake	can	candy	carrot	can't	cat	chair	chicken
close	cold	cows	cup	dance	desk	dog	door	down
ear	egg	elephant	eraser	eye	fish	fly	glove	grape
hamburger	hands	happy	hello	how	I	ice cream	I'm	is
it	it's	jump	kangaroo	like	lion	many	monkey	mouth
nose	o'clock	open	orange	pants	pear	pen	pencil	pig
play	present	raining	ruler	run	shoes	sit	skate	ski
snowing	snowman	socks	stand	sun	sweater	swim	this	time
up	wash	watermelon	what	your				

4th grade (39/79)

baby	badminton	ball	baseball	bat	beautiful	bed	bike	bird
box	boxing	boy	bread	brother	bus	cap	cloudy	computer
did	do	doll	don't	everyone	family	father	flower	he
help	hi	home	hotel	house	ink	juice	king	lunch
meet	mother	much	news	nice	notebook	old	pencil case	pin
print	queen	radio	rainbow	rainy	ring	robot	rocket	she
sister	snowy	sports	soccer	sorry	sunny	table	table tennis	taxi
tennis	thank	that	to	toy	truck	tulip	umbrella	violin
watch	weather	who	x-ray	years'	yellow	you		

5th grade (88/156)

about	and	are	around	at	backyard	bad	bank	bathroom
bedroom	boat	breakfast	brown	buy	camping	chopstick	check	classroom
clean	come on	dad	day	dinner	does	doing	driver	everybody
everyday	excellent	face	fast	faster	feel	fine	fishing	fork
full	fun	future	get up	glue	go	goat	good	grandpa's
grandparents	great	hair	hat	have	here's	hiking	homework	hungry
hurry up	ice	in	join	jumping	key	kicking	kitchen	knife
know	left	lesson	let's	listen	living room	long	look	mam
make	may	mine	more	morning	museum	must	my	name
no	oh	on	out of	paper	park	piano	please	potato
race	read	red	right	ring	river	rock	running	school
science	scissors	see	shopping	sick	sing	skating	sky	small
snake	so	some	sounds	speaking	spoon	straight	study	sure
swimming	tall	taller	teacher	telephone	tennis	tent	than	thanks
that's	the	there	today	tower	T.V.	umbrella	uncle's	under
us	vacation	very	visit	want	was	well	what's	where
white	whose	will	window	winner	wonderful	work	yeah	yes
yesterday	yourself	zoo						

6th grade (65/99)

after	all	bad	bang	because	behind	bigger	bus stop	bus driver
busy	card	change		children's day	come back	congratulations	cook	cool
corner	cousins	dear	doctor	dollars	driver	English	excuse	expensive
fall	faster	floor	friend	from	games	good bye	grandfather	headache
here	holiday	hospital	hot	invite	kind	live	longer	love
ma'am	main street	me	middle	miss	mom	month	mouse	near
not	now	nurse	off	of course	okay	older	pianist	pie

pilot	police officer	post office	problem	ride	sandwich	singer	sir	so long
speaking	Spring	street	stronger	summer	surprise	take off	than	thirsty
tomorrow	too	try	turn	warm	watch out	water	way	we
welcome	went	when	why	winter	with	would	write	yours

Table 5: Target sentences in the lessons section of Japanese textbook.

Lesson

Lesson 1	1. I like ~ . 2. Do you like ~? 3. I don't like ~
Lesson 2	4. I have two dogs. 5. What do you ~?
Lesson 3	6. My father works ~. 7. Does she/he ~? 8. She/he doesn't ~.
Lesson 4	9. I'm ~. 10. You're ~. 11. Are you ~? 12. I'm not ~.
Lesson 5	13. Mihi is ~. 14. Is she/he ~? 15. Where ~?
Lesson 6	16. Shun and Jim are /like ~. 17. What's ~? 18. Who is ~?
Lesson 7	19. I can ~. 20. I can't ~. 21 Can you ~? 22 Tell me/us ~.
Lesson 8	23 I'm watching ~. 24 Are you studying ~? 25 When ~?
Lesson 9	26 I played ~. 27 Did you ~? 28 I didn't ~.

When the new words in each textbook are compared, those in the Korean textbooks seem to be more commonly used in daily life and tend to be more varied. Among the words which are introduced in the Japanese textbook, and not in the Korean textbooks, words such as jazz, octopus, gardening, conditioner, blind, Braille, turkey, and jellyfish appear. In the author's opinion, these words are not as high frequency in daily life as words such as wash, radio, news, bread, long, kitchen, uncle, hospital, etc. which are introduced in the Korean textbooks but not in the Japanese one. This opinion is supported by Collins COBUILD English Dictionary (2006) as follows. Information on the frequency of words in COBUILD is given using three frequency bands shown by blue diamonds, so that users can see how important a word is. The most frequent words have three diamonds, which is shown below by (3), the next most frequent two, (2), and the ones which are less frequent have one diamond (1). Words which occur even less frequently, but which deserve an entry in the dictionary, do not have any blue diamonds (0). Below are the listed frequencies of these words.

★ Words in the Japanese textbook but not in the Korean textbooks

Jazz(1) octopus(0) gardening(0) conditioner(0)
blind(1)
Braille(0) turkey(0) jellyfish(0)

★ Words in the Korean textbooks and not in the Japanese textbook

wash(1) radio(3) news(3) bread(1) long(3)

kitchen(2) uncle(2) hospital(3)

Although these words are only a selection from those found exclusively in the respective textbooks, they strongly support the overall contention that the vocabulary used in the Korean textbooks is more appropriate for early learners of English.

3. Target English sentences

The author found 28 target English sentences in the lessons section (See table 5), 21 in the beginning, 9 in the "Talking Scene" section and 7 in the "Action" section as listed below, totaling 65 target English sentences in the Japanese textbook as you see in table 6.:

Table 6: Target sentences in other sections of the Japanese textbook.

Beginning

29. Hello, Nice to meet you. 30. This is ~. 31. How are you?

32. I'm fine, thank you. And you? 33. I'm sorry.

34. That's all right.

35. Thank you. 36. You're welcome. 37. Excuse me.

38. Pardon? 39. How do you say~?

40. Open your books to page~. 41. Close your books. 42. Listen to ~. 43. Repeat after me.

44. Look at ~. 45. Make a group of ~. 46. Good morning. 47. Good afternoon.

48. Good-bye. 49. See you.

Talking scene

50 Good night. 51. Get up. 52. Not bad 53. Not so

Table 7: Target sentences in the lessons section of Korean textbooks.

Lesson	Third grade	Fourth grade
1	1 Hello, I'm Minsu.	9 Nice to meet you
2	2 What's This?	10 Don't Do That
3	3 Happy Birthday!	11 How Old Are You?
4	4 Wash Your Hands	12 What Time Is It?
5	5 I Like Apples	13 Who Is She?
6	6 How Many Cows?	14 Is It Your Cap?
7	7 I Can Swim	15 Sorry, I Can't
8	8 It's Snowing	16 How Much Is It?

Lesson	Fifth grade	Sixth grade
1	17 How Are You?	33 Where Are You From?
2	18 What Day Is It Today?	34 Is This York Street?
3	19 It's Under the Table	35 I Like Spring
4	20 What a Nice Day!	36 When Is your Birthday?
5	21 Where Is Numdaemun?	37 May I Help You?
6	22 I Get Up at Seven Every Day	38 Can I Have Some Water?
7	23 She's Tall	39 My Father Is a Pilot
8	24 Let's Go Swimming	40 What Will You Do This Summer?
9	25 Whose Ball Is This?	41 How Was Your Vacation?
10	26 Do You Want Some More?	42 I'm Stronger than You
11	27 What Are You Doing?	43 What Do You Want to Do?
12	28 This Is a Bedroom	44 Will You Help Me, Please?
13	29 What Did You Do Yesterday?	45 That's Too Bad
14	30 Is Peter There?	46 Could You Like to Come to My House?
15	31 Can You Join Us?	47 It's Time to Go Home
16	32 Did You Have a Nice Vacation?	48 So Long, Everyone!

good. 54. Time for bed.

55. I want a ~. 56. For here or to go? 57. Here you are. 58. How much ~?

“Action”

59. Stand up. 60. Don't run. 61. How many dolls do you have? 62. What time is it?

63. What time do you get up? 64. Which fruit do you like, apples or oranges?

65. Whose textbook is it?

The table 7 shows the 48 target sentences in the lessons of South Korean textbooks.

The table 7 shows the 48 target sentences in the lessons sections of Korean textbooks. The table 8 shows the target sentences that author found in the sections of “Let's chant” or “Let's sing” in Korean textbooks. (The same sentences as those written above were excluded)

Table 8: Target sentences in other sections of Korean textbooks.

5th grade

Lesson 1 1 I'm fine. 2 How about you? 3 I'm very well.

Lesson 2 4 It's ~ .

Lesson 3 5 Where's my watch? 6 Oh, thanks, Mom. 7 Please, hurry up!

8 It's in the box. 9 Oh, thanks, Dad.

Lesson 4 10 It's so beautiful. 11 What a tall tower!

Lesson 5 12 Excuse me, where is ~. 13 Go straight and turn right

14 Turn right at the bank (at the school.)

Lesson 6 15 I wash my face at seven. 16 I go to school at eight thirty.

17 I do my homework everyday.

Lesson 7 18 He (She) is good.(wonderful, kind) 19 That's my teacher.

Lesson 8 20 Sorry, I can't. 21 I have a piano lesson.

22 Let's go shopping this Saturday. 23 Sounds good. 24 I'm the winner.

Lesson 9 25 Whose boat is this? 26 It's (not) mine.

27 The bag is mine.

Lesson 10 28 Help yourself. 29 What's this? 30 Um,

- it's good. 31 Oh, no thanks.
- Lesson 11 32 What is she doing? 33 He's running.
- Lesson 12 34 This is a living room. 35 I wake up (get out of bed) in the morning. 36 I look around and see. 37 Oh! I'm in the future house. 38 And that's a bedroom. 39 What a wonderful thing!
- Lesson 13 40 I went to Riverside Park. 41 Did you have fun? 42 Yes, very much.
- Lesson 14 43 Speaking. 44 This is Nami. 45 Hello, there. 46 Let's play soccer. 47 Oh, sounds good. 48 Can we meet at the park? 49 OK, see you there.
- Lesson 15 50 Come on, everybody. 51 Oh, sure. 52 Oh, sorry. 53 I must go home.
- Lesson 16 54 Yes, I did. 55 What did you do? 56 I went to my uncle's house.
- 6th grade**
- Lesson 1 57 I'm from ~.
- Lesson 2 58 Oh, well excuse me, sir. 59 Sorry, I don't know. 60 Can you help me ma'am? 61 Where is York Street?
- Lesson 3 62 Do you like ~? 63 It's cool.(cold, warm, hot) 64 I feel good.
- Lesson 4 65 My birthday is May 10th. 66 When is yours? 67 It's June 5th.
- Lesson 5 68 How much is this toy car? 69 It's \$20. 70 OK. I'll take it. 71 It's too expensive. 72 Yes, please. 73
- Here's your change. 74. Thank you. 75 The book is \$3.
- Lesson 6 76 Can I have some hamburgers? 77 I'm thirsty.(hungry) 78 Sure. 79 Here you are.
- Lesson 7 80 This is my father. 81 He is a pilot. 82 I want to be a police officer. 83 Does your mother work?
- Lesson 8 84 I will visit my uncle in London.
- Lesson 9 85 It was great. 86 I went to the museum. 87 I was sick. 88 It was a holiday today.
- Lesson 10 89 My brother is very tall. 90 He is taller than my father. 91 Can you run fast? 92 Sure, of course. 93 Are you sure? 94 Oh, what a surprise! 95 Tom is my friend. 96 I'm too small.
- Lesson 11 97 Tomorrow is my mom's birthday. 98 I want to cook for Mom. 99 My brother will make a card. 100 We will have a good time.
- Lesson 12 101 I want to clean the living room. 102 I'm busy now. 103 I must do my homework. 104 No problem. 105 Will you help me with my homework? 106 You're welcome.
- Lesson 13 107 I was at home all day. 108 I was sick. 109 My friends visited me with beautiful flowers. 110 I was happy. 111 Now I'm okay. 112 I'm sorry. 113 He

Table 9: Target sentences commonly found in both Japanese and Korean textbooks.

Target English sentence	Japanese textbook	S.K. textbooks
1 How are you?	Beginning	5 th grade (L.1)
2 Hello, nice to meet you.	Beginning	4 th grade (L.1)
3 This is ~	Beginning	5 th grade (L.12)
4 I like basketball.	Lesson 1 (p.16)	3 rd grade (L.5) 6 th grade (L.3)
5 Do you~?	Lesson 1 (p.18)	5 th grade (L.10)
6 I don't~?	Lesson 1 (p.20)	"Let's sing" 59
7 I have two dogs.	Lesson 2	"Let's sing" 21
8 What do you ~?	Lesson 2	6 th grade (L.11)
9 Does your father have any hobbies?	Lesson 3	"Let's sing" 83
10 I'm~.	Lesson 4 (p.43)	3 rd grade (L,1)
11 I'm not ~.	Lesson 4 (p.43)	3 rd grade (L,1)
12 Mihi is ~.	Lesson 5 (p.51)	6 th grade (L.7) "Let's sing" 81

13 Is Mihi your classmate?	Lesson 5 (p.51)	4 th grade (L.6) 5 th grade (L.14)
14 Where ~?	Lesson 5 (p.53)	5 th grade (L.5) "Let's sing" 61
15 What's ~?	Lesson 6 (p.62)	3 rd grade (L.2) "Let's sing" 29
16 Who is ~?	Lesson 6 (p.63)	4 th grade (L.5)
17 I can ~.	Lesson 7 (p.69)	3 rd grade (L.7)
18 I can't~.	Lesson 7 (p.69)	4 th grade (L.7)
19 Can ~?	Lesson 7 (p.70)	5 th grade (L.15)
20 I'm watching.	Lesson 8 (p.81)	"Let's sing" 33
21 When ~?	Lesson 8 (p.83)	6 th grade (L.4)
22 I played ~.	Lesson 9 (p.91)	"Let's sing" 40
23 Did you ~?	Lesson 9 (p.92)	5 th grade (L.16)
24 I didn't ~.	Lesson 9 (p.92)	5 th grade (L.16)
25 Thank you.	Talking scene 32	"Let's sing" 74
26 I'm sorry.	Beginning 34	"Let's sing" 20 "Let's sing" 112
27 You're welcome.	Beginning 37	"Let's sing" 106
28 Here you are.	Talking scene 44	"Let's sing" 79
29 How much ~?	Talking scene 45	4 th grade (L.8)
30 Time for bed	Talking scene (p.56) 55	6 th grade (L.15)
31 Stand up.	Action (p.28) 60	3 rd grade (L.4)
32 Don't run.	Action (p.28) 61	4 th grade (L.2) "Let's sing" 115
33 How many ~ do you have?	Action (p.49) 62	3 rd grade (L.6)
34 What time is it?	Action (p.66) 63	4 th grade (L.4)
35 What time do you get up?	Action (p.66) 64	5 th grade (L.6)
36 Whose textbook is it?	Action (p.88) 66	5 th grade (L.9) "Let's sing" 25

has a bad cold.

114 because she is so sick.

Lesson 14 115 Don't take off your shoes. 116 We don't take our shoes off in the house.

Lesson 15 117 Come here. 118 What time is it? 119 Not now. 120 No way. 121 Come back. 122 Watch out. 123 Don't go that way.

Lesson 16 124 What middle school are you going to? 125 That's where I'm going.

Out of 65 target English sentences which the author found in the Japanese textbook, 36 sentences (about 55.3%) are also found in the Korean textbooks. They are shown in the table 9.

Among the sentences in the Japanese textbook, there are 20 target English sentences which the author found in the lessons (the sentences in other sections are excluded) of Korean textbooks. (There are 28 sentences commonly found in the lessons of both countries' textbooks so, 28 out of 36 in the table 9 plus 20 equal 48):

Table 10: Target sentences found in Korean textbooks but not in the Japanese textbook.

- 1 Happy Birthday! 3rd grade (L.3)
- 2 How old are you? 4th grade (L.3)
- 3 It's snowing. 3rd grade (L.8)
- 4 What day is it today? 5th grade (L.2)
- 5 It's under the table. 5th grade (L.3)
- 6 What a nice day! 5th grade (L.4)
- 7 She's tall. 5th grade (L.7)
- 8 Let's go swimming. 5th grade (L.8)
- 9 What are you doing? 5th grade (L.11)
- 10 What did you do yesterday? 5th grade (L.13)
- 11 Where are you from? 6th grade (L.1)
- 12 Is this York Street? 6th grade (L.2)
- 13 May I help you? 6th grade (L.5)
- 14 What will you do this summer?
6th grade (L.8)
- 15 How was your vacation? 6th grade

- (L.9)
 16 I'm stronger than you. 6th grade (L.10)
 17 Will you help me, please? 6th grade (L.12)
 18 That's too bad. 6th grade (L.13)
 19 Would you like to come to my house? 6th grade (L.14)
 20 So long, everyone! 6th grade (L.16)

It was also found that the future tense, infinitives used as nouns, comparatives, and exclamatory sentences are not learned in the 1st year of Japanese junior high school while they are learned at Korean elementary schools. Due to the large number, the author has not included the sentences in the sections such as "Let's sing" and "Let's chant" in Korean textbooks which the author was not able to find in the Japanese textbook. (125 sentences minus 15 sentences in table 9 equal 110 sentences.)

Target English sentences that the author found in the lessons of the Japanese textbook but not in the lessons of the Korean textbooks are as follows (There are 21 sentences commonly found in both countries' textbooks so, 21 in the table 9 plus 7 equals 28):

Table 11: Target sentences in the Japanese textbook but not in the Korean textbooks.

- 1 My father works in a library. (L.3)
- 2 My father(He) doesn't teach English. (L.3)
- 3 You're ~. (L.4)
- 4 Are you~? (L.4)
- 5 Shun and Jim are like ~.(L.6)
- 6 Tell me/us ~. (L.7)
- 7 Are you studying ~? (L.8)

These target English sentences, absent from the Korean textbooks, indicate that South Korean elementary school children do not learn the third person singular present tense of regular verbs. If the sentences in other sections are included, 29 sentences (65 minus 36) in the Japanese textbook are not found in the Korean textbooks.

4. Grammatical Points

According to the teacher's manual for Japanese junior high school English language classes and texts (Chugakko Gakushu Shido-yoryo 2008), there are 34 grammatical points which should be learned during the three years of junior high school. It was found that about 83% of these grammatical points (28 out of 34), are covered in the Korean textbooks used in grades three through six. The six points not covered are underlined in table 12. Here the author counts the grammatical points which are demonstrated in the target English sentences. This does not mean that the grammatical points are explained in the South Korean elementary classes. The following are the 34 grammatical points learned in Japanese junior high schools. Those underlined are not found in target English sentences in the Korean textbooks.

Table 12: The 34 grammar points covered in three years of Japanese junior high school.

- 1 simple sentence 2 compound sentence 3 complex sentence 4 affirmative declarative sentence 5 negative declarative sentence 6 affirmative imperative sentence 7 negative imperative sentence 8 interrogative with verb 9 interrogative with auxiliary verb 10 interrogative with How 11 interrogative with What 12 interrogative with Which 13 interrogative with When 14 interrogative with Where 15 interrogative with Who 16 interrogative with Whose 17 sentence pattern I 18 sentence pattern II 19 sentence pattern III 20 sentence pattern IV 21 sentence pattern V 22 personal pronoun 23 demonstrative pronoun 24 relative pronoun 25 present tense 26 past tense 27 present progressive 28 past progressive 29 present perfect 30 future tense with auxiliary verb 31 comparative adjective 32 comparative adverb 34 infinitive as noun

Of the grammatical points which should be learned in the first year of junior high school, the Korean textbook sentences cover all the grammatical points except the following three as we already saw in the previous chapter.

1. the third person singular present tense of regular verbs
2. the third person singular negative form

regular verb (item 5 in table 12)

3. Interrogatives with Which (item 12 in table 12)

1 and 2 are the sentences in the lessons and found in table 11 and 3 is found in the “Action” section as in sentence 64. Conversely, grammatical points illustrated in target English sentences found in the Korean textbooks but not found in the Japanese textbook are:

- 1 future tense with the auxiliary verb Will
- 2 infinitives as noun
- 3 comparative adjective
- 4 exclamatory sentence

Kawai (2005) quotes an English letter from the 6th grade South Korean textbook (p.132) as an example showing a Korean 6th grader’s English level is equal to a Japanese 9th grader’s level. He says that at the end of 6th grade, Korean elementary children are taught to write the following English letter:

Dear Andy

Hello. My name is Lee Nami. I live in Seoul, Korea. I’m 13 years old.

I have one brother. I like playing computer games. I want to know about you.

Please write me back. Good-bye.

Nami

However, while the author found that the following introduction in the “In your words” section of the Japanese English textbook (p.75) is indeed similar to the English letter, introducing name, hometown, and favorite activity,

This is Matsui Hideki. His nickname is “Godzilla”. He lives in New York.

He is very good at baseball. He’s a member of the New York Yankees.

I like him very much.

the difference lies in that it is a self-introduction in the Korean textbook but an introduction of another person in the Japanese textbook. The underlined sentence thus includes the present tense of the third person singular which is not found in the Korean textbooks, and illustrates one example of a point covered exclusively by the Japanese textbook.

5. Other characteristics

In the Korean textbooks, the list of the chapter titles in each grade’s textbook clearly shows what children learn since each chapter has only one target English sentence and it becomes the title of the chapter. This is not the case with the Japanese textbook because each chapter title only indicates the content of a story in the chapter, while each chapter contains several target English sentences. The following are some example titles from the Korean 6th grade textbook (9 out of 16) and all the titles from the Japanese junior high school textbook.

Table 13: A selection of Korean chapter titles

South Korean 6th grade textbook

- 1 Where are you from?
- 2 Is this York Street?
- 3 I like Spring.
- 4 When is your birthday?
- 5 May I help you?
- 6 Can I have some water?
- 7 My father is a pilot.
- 8 What will you do this summer?
- 9 How was your vacation?

Table 14: All of the Japanese chapter titles

Japanese junior high school textbook

- 1 I like basketball
- 2 Pets and T.V.
- 3 Ms. Beck’s Family
- 4 Hi, Jim.
- 5 Nice to meet you, Mihi!
- 6 Halloween
- 7 Braille
- 8 New Year
9. A letter from New Zealand

The author considers that the Korean textbooks are better focused on learning high frequency English expressions used in daily conversation (see also comments in Section 2), and are also more clearly focused on functional aspects of English. The objectives of English education in South Korean elementary schools will therefore be fulfilled by these textbooks, (namely) 1) to create interest and confidence in English and cultivate basic communicative ability in English and 2) to enable natural communication on topics of daily life

(Kimura 2007).

However, as indicated by the declared objective of foreign language education in Japanese junior high schools, namely “Through foreign language, to deepen the understanding of language and culture, cultivate the basic communication abilities of listening, speaking, reading, and writing as well as the attitude to communicate with others positively”,(Chugakko Gakushu Shido Yoryo 2008), the Japanese textbook is more satisfactory in promoting cultural understanding than the Korean textbooks are. This is supported by more chapters dealing with cultural understanding in the Japanese textbook when compared with the Korean textbooks. For example, the author found only one lesson dealing with cultural understanding in the latter, which is the song in Lesson 14 in the 6th grade textbook “Don’t take off your shoes. We don’t take off our shoes in the house.” In contrast, in the Japanese textbook, the author found many more examples. The front page introduces greetings in different languages such as French, Chinese, German, Korean, Swahili, Arabic, Spanish, Portuguese, Russian and English. It also introduces annual events in English speaking countries, such as in Lesson 6 “Halloween” and in Lesson 8 “New Year”, introducing different ways to celebrate New Year’s Day. It also teaches how to introduce Japanese annual events in English in “In Your’ Words” (p.86). At the end of the book, it shows the festivals of several countries such as Spain, Brazil, U.S., Indonesia, South Korea, Bulgaria and Kenya.

As for the recommended procedure involved in learning a target English sentence, each Korean textbook follows 12 steps:

Table 15: 12 steps in Korean textbook lessons

- 1 Look & Listen 1
- 2 Listen & Repeat
- 3 Let’s play
- 4 Look & Listen 2
- 5 Listen & Repeat 2
- 6 Let’s chat
- 7 Let’s play 2
- 8 Look & speak
- 9 Let’s sing

- 10 Let’s play
- 11 Let’s role-play
- 12 Let’s review

Even though this learning procedure is almost the same in each textbook from 3rd to 6th grade, some additional different steps are added in each grade. In 4th grade, the book has a “Let’s read” section where pupils read the alphabet and easy words such as “book” and “cap”. In 5th grade, the text has the sections “Let’s write & repeat” and “Activity” where students start to write sentences such as “I played baseball.” The 6th grade textbook has “Reading”, “Writing” and “Activity” sections where students may read a letter composed of 40 words or fill in the blanks in sentences with suitable words.

In the Japanese textbook, each chapter has five steps to learn a few target English sentences: 1 listening, 2 contents, 3 new words, 4 comprehension check and 5 activities. The procedure to learn target English sentences in the Korean textbooks provides more repeated and detailed steps than the Japanese textbook does. In the case of the Japanese textbook, since it offers fewer steps to learn target English sentences and fewer repetitions, as well as more target English sentences at a time, the author feels that it may be harder for pupils to use the target English sentences in conversation, even though they may be able to read and understand them.

Even though each chapter has only five steps to learn the target sentences, the Japanese textbook has five “Action” sections in which pupils learn target English sentences through actions, and four “In your words” sections to help students improve their speaking and writing skills. In a section entitled “Talking scenes” pupils learn how to greet, how to order or ask prices, and a sample of daily conversation is given. “Reading” is the section where pupils read a poem or explanatory essay. The Japanese textbook benefits from these sections but their random placing may cause confusion for pupils.

Chats and songs in the Korean textbooks are all closely related to target English sentences and all the chapters have both elements, whereas only three songs and no chats are found in the Japanese textbook.

III Conclusion

Regarding the first research question, 1) Is the level of South Korean elementary school English language textbooks about the same or higher than that of the Japanese first year junior high school English language textbook?, the author concludes that the Korean elementary school English language textbooks are indeed teaching to the same or a higher level than the Japanese first year junior high school English language textbook on the following grounds:

1. Length of English sentences: the average words per sentence in the Japanese textbook is 3.92. The average words per sentence in the South Korean textbooks is 4.17.
2. New words: 45.5% of the new words in the Japanese textbook are introduced in the South Korean textbooks, while 50.1% new words in the Korean textbooks are introduced in the Japanese textbook. However, the number of words learned in the Korean textbooks exceeds that in the Japanese textbook by 420 to 381.
3. Target English sentences: Out of the 65 target English sentences which the author found in the Japanese textbook, 36 sentences (about 55.3%) are also found in the Korean textbooks. When limited to the sentences in the lessons of the respective textbooks, 20 target sentences in the Korean textbooks were not found in the Japanese textbook while 7 target sentences in the Japanese textbook were not found in the Korean textbooks.
4. Grammatical points: Target sentences in the Korean textbooks cover all the grammatical points except three which are covered in the Japanese textbook. Target sentences in the Japanese textbook cover all the grammatical points except four which are covered in the Korean textbooks.

Regarding research question ②, concerning the characteristic differences between the textbooks, the author examined the list of chapter titles and the chapter structure. The chapter titles in the Korean textbooks are not only closely related to the target sentence dealt with in each chapter, but are actually the target English sentences themselves. Therefore,

lists of the chapter titles in the Korean textbooks show what children will learn more clearly than the chapter titles in the Japanese textbook do. It can be seen that the Korean textbooks focus on the functional aspect of English. The Japanese textbook is organized to teach target English sentences in a story, and this is reflected in the list of titles. This indicates a stronger focus on reading.

The Korean textbooks provide more repeated and detailed steps to learn target English sentences than the Japanese textbook does, making them the better of the two for practicing and using target English sentences. However, from the perspective of cultural understanding, the Japanese textbook provides more culturally relevant topics. In conclusion, the Korean textbook is better for learning and using practical daily English whereas the Japanese textbook promotes reading and deeper cultural understanding.

Acknowledgement

I would like to thank two reviewers for his/her patience and effort in reading the manuscript and making a number of helpful suggestions. One of them is Ms. Caroline Latham and another is anonymous. Without, these people, this paper could have not been completed.

References

- Gakusyu-shido youryo (2008) 学習指導要領 (2008) 文部科学省
- Kazuo Nagahara & Hisanori Kimira (1990) 高等学校用英語教科書 Unicorn I、II、II B の語彙分析「小樽女子短期大学紀要」19pp7-73 High School English Language Textbook Unicorn I, II II B Vocabulary analysis "Otaru Jhoshi Tanki Daigaku Kiyoh" 19 pp.7-73
- Kenji Kitao & Shosaku Tanaka (2007) 「中学校英語検定教科書の特徴—語彙とリーダビリティ—の視点から」"Characteristics of Junior high school English textbook -From the perspectives of vocabulary and readability" www.cis.doshisha.ac.jp/kkitao/Japanese/library/handout/2007/LET/5-12.pdf
- Kyoiku jinteki shigenbu (2002) 「小学校英語6年生」Elementary School English 6 Seoul:Daikan Kyokasho Kabushikigaisha
- Tadahito Kawai (2005) 「日本の学校英語教育はどこ

- へ行くの？」松拍社“Where does Japanese school English education go?” Matuhaku-sha
- Total English (2009) 中学校1年生英語教科書
1st year Junior High School English Language
Textbook Gakko Toshō
- Yukio Tohno (2008) 教育再生懇談会会議資料基盤研究A (小池科研)
Material for the Meeting on Education Reform
Basic Research A (Koike Kaken)
- Yuzo Kimura (2007) 全訳「初等学校授業改善のための英語教科教育課程運営材料」韓国初等学校英語教育カリキュラムの基礎資料富山大学杉谷キャンパス一般教育研究紀要 JLAS (vol.35, 2007) Translation
“English curriculum administrative material to improve elementary school classes” Basic material of English education curriculum at Korean elementary school. Toyama University